Development Management Sub-Committee Report

Wednesday 7 February 2024

Application for Listed Building Consent 2 - 14 Shandwick Place, 1 - 8 Queensferry Street & 1 - 3 Queensferry Street Lane, Edinburgh

Proposal: Alterations to create hotel /aparthotel (as amended).

Item – Committee Decision Application Number – 23/01947/LBC Ward – B11 - City Centre

Reasons for Referral to Committee

The application has been referred to the Development Management Sub-Committee because an objection has been received from a statutory consultee and the recommendation is to grant listed building consent. Consequently, under the Council's Scheme of Delegation, the application must be determined by the Development Management Sub-Committee.

The application requires the Scottish Ministers to be notified prior to determination due to this statutory consultee objection.

Recommendation

It is recommended that this application be **Granted** subject to the details below.

Summary

The proposal will have significant impacts on listed buildings particularly through the loss of original staircases and Historic Environment Scotland have objected on these grounds.

Internally, changes to these features have already occurred which have diminished their contribution to the buildings' overall historic or special interest. The degree of further intervention to these features is appropriate in this context as its overall impact is not harmful. It forms part of works that help provide a new use to these buildings. All other changes are appropriate in this regard. The proposal in scale, form and design is also in keeping with the historic environment.

The proposal is therefore acceptable with regard to Sections 14 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 as it will not harm the listed buildings, their setting and will preserve the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

The application requires the Scottish Ministers to be notified prior to determination due to the outstanding objection from Historic Environment Scotland.

SECTION A – Application Background

Site Description

The site includes four separate buildings as per the following:

4-8 Queensferry Street is an early 19th century, category B -listed building (LB ref: 29577, date added 14/12/1970). A three-storey classical terrace which is one of the last surviving of the original James Tait plan. Similar town houses at 1-3 Queensferry Street were later replaced by the bank building. It contains later 19th century dormers on its roof slope with evenly proportioned sash and case windows below. Its upper floors have lawful use as a hostel. The site also includes the ground floor food and drink unit (class 3) at no. 7-8.

2-4 Shandwick Place and 1-4 Queensferry Street is an early 20th century category B-listed building (LB ref: 30180, date added 30/01/1981). It has five storeys in total (four and an attic) and occupies a prominent location on the corner of Shandwick Place and Queensferry Street. Some key features include a turret with curved gable features either side. It was originally a bank and most recently the upper floors have been a hostel with 4-8 Queensferry Street. The existing entrance is taken from Queensferry Street. The site includes the ground floor betting unit at 2 Queensferry Street.

6-8 Shandwick Place is a late 19th century category C-listed building (LB ref: 51342, date added: 22/07/2009) of four storeys. Key detailing includes a bay window feature at ground floor and arched openings on its uppermost floor with intricate astragal detailing. The upper floors contain flats.

10-14 Shandwick Place is an unlisted four storey Victorian tenement with bay window features. It has been extended to the rear which connects to the tenement building on Queensferry Street Lane and adjacent 1.5 storey building. The upper floors have lawful use as a nightclub and restaurant.

These buildings have mainly been constructed in traditional building materials (sandstone, slate, timber sash and case windows). The upper floors of all buildings are currently unoccupied.

The site is located within the City Centre where there are a range of uses are evident. It is near to public transport facilities including bus services on Queensferry Street and a tram stop on Shandwick Place.

The site is also located in the New Town Conservation Area and Old and New Towns of Edinburgh World Heritage Site. Its area is 0.19 hectares in total.

Description of the Proposal

The hotel development will comprise of 129 bedrooms in total and connect all four of the above buildings internally.

The main hotel entrance for guests will be taken from Queensferry Street where the existing betting unit will be replaced, with a staff entrance from Queensferry Street Lane. Lifts will be located near each entrance providing access to all floors, near to accessible bedrooms on the Queensferry street side of the development.

At basement level there will be a gym, staff facilities, plant machinery and bicycle store. 14 cycle spaces will be provided in total (11 sheffield stands and 3 non-standard racks). A landscaped courtyard will be formed at first floor level at the rear bordered by the development on all four sides.

In total,1,631.6 m² new build floorspace will be added with the external alterations to each building including the following:

6-8 and 10-14 Shandwick Place

- A dark zinc pitched roof top extension with four projecting dormers centrally positioned over windows below (nos 10-14) and a bay window feature (nos 6-8).
- Demolish first floor of rear extension (nos. 10-14) and construct a new four storey rear extension constructed in light render with dual-pane windows and juliet balconies of uniform design facing an internal courtyard area.

Queensferry Street Lane

 Demolish existing 1.5 storey building and replace with a new, four storey extension. Materials include a light render on upper floors with the window pattern including a dual and single pane vertical arrangement. A stone facade will be at ground floor with roller shutters doors.

1-4 Queensferry Street

 Removal of ground floor betting office unit at 2 Queensferry Street and replace with hotel entrance including dual paned timber panelled door set within glazed arched opening with timber frames. A new gate is to be added over the existing hostel entrance.

4-8 Queensferry Street

 Remove existing dormers and replace with five dark zinc clad dormers of uniform design.

The proposed hotel includes various change of uses to the hotel (total 1,946 m²) detailed below:

- 10-14 Shandwick Place (upper floors) from a night club (sui generis) / restaurant (class 3) to a hotel (class 7)
- 6-8 Shandwick Place (upper floors) from storage and residential (Class 9) to hotel (class 7)
- 4-8 Queensferry Street (upper floors) partly from residential (class 9) and hostel (class 7) to a hotel (class 9)

- 2 Queensferry Street (ground floor) from betting office (sui generis) to hotel (class 7).
- 1-3 Queensferry Street Lane from a nightclub (sui generis) to hotel (class 7)

Revised Scheme

Internal alterations

- Number of bedrooms increased from 115 to 129.
- Increase in cycle parking.
- Changes to internal layout
- Extent of raised floor reduced to not extend into the former bank buildings' public rooms.
- Retention of pyramidal skylight in former bank building.
- Increased retention or relocation of original features in all buildings.

6-8 and 10-14 Shandwick Place

- Design of roof top extension changed with gable form of east section replaced with pitch roof of lower height and window design changed.
- Change to form of rear extension to retain existing pitch roof of tenement building on Queensferry Street Lane and materials from brick to sandstone / light render and dark to light bronze zinc clad.

Queensferry Street

- Proposed additional storey on front elevation and wall structure to house plant equipment to rear omitted on 4-8 Queensferry Street.
- New glass panel to front entrance of existing hostel on 3 Queensferry Street replaced with a gate.

1-3 Queensferry Street Lane

Colour of zinc clad on extension changed from dark grey to light render.

Supporting Information

- Architect Consultation Response
- Design and Access Statement
- Heritage Statement
- Planning Statement
- Sustainability Statement and S1 Form

Concurrent applications

3 May 2023 - Planning application 23/01940/FUL submitted for part change of use, alterations, and erection of hotel / aparthotel (Class 7) and Conservation area consent application 23/01948/CON submitted for substantial demolition in a conservation area.

These applications are presently under consideration and are related to this listed building consent application.

Relevant Site History

23/01940/FUL

2 - 14 Shandwick Place, 1 - 8 Queensferry Street &

1 - 3 Queensferry Street Lane

Edinburgh

Part change of use, alterations, and erection of hotel /aparthotel (Class 7). (as amended)

23/01948/CON

3 Queensferry Street Lane, 4 - 8 Queensferry Street & 10 - 14 Shandwick Place Edinburgh

Substantial demolition in a conservation area.

Other Relevant Site History

5 November 2010 - Planning permission granted for residential flats at 12 Shandwick Place - application reference: 06/03775/FUL.

19 November 2015 Planning permission granted for renewal of application of application 06/03775/FUL at 12 Shandwick Place - application reference 15/04522/FUL.

3 April 2019 - Planning permission granted for Section 42 application to amend noise conditions at 12 Shandwick Place - application reference 18/08608/FUL.

23 June 2021 - Planning permission granted for change of use to short stay lets at 8 Shandwick Place - application reference 21/02525/FUL.

Pre-Application process

Pre-application discussions took place on this application.

Consultation Engagement

Historic Environment Scotland

Archaeologist

Refer to Appendix 1 for a summary of the consultation response.

Publicity and Public Engagement

Date of Neighbour Notification: Not Applicable

Date of Renotification of Neighbour Notification: Not Applicable

Press Publication Date(s): 2 June 2023 Site Notices Date(s): 29 May 2023 **Number of Contributors: 10**

Section B - Assessment

Determining Issues

Due to the proposals relating to a listed building(s) within a conservation area, this application for listed building consent requires to be assessed against Sections 14 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 (the "1997 Heritage Act"):

- Having due regard to HES Policy and guidance, do the proposals:
 - a. harm a listed building or its setting? or
 - b. conflict with the objective of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of the conservation area?
- If the proposals do comply with HES Policy and guidance, are there any compelling reasons (including but not limited to the public sector equality duty) for not approving them?
- If the proposals do not comply with HES Policy and guidance, are there any compelling reasons (including but not limited to the public sector equality duty) for approving them?

Assessment

To address these determining issues, it needs to be considered whether:

a) The proposals harm the listed building or its setting.

The following HES guidance is relevant in the determination of this application:

- Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Extensions
- Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Interiors
- Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Roofs
- Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Setting
- Managing Change in the Historic Environment: Windows

6-8 Shandwick Place, LB ref 51342, dated 22/07/2009.

HES guidance on extensions states these should play a subordinate role and not dominate the original building. It should not threaten the original design concept. Where external form is significant to a buildings' character a roof extension will not be appropriate that destroys this.

The roof top extension will change the buildings' appearance as a pitched roof is not part of its original form. However, its overall design takes appropriate cues from the listed building. Its height is in proportion to the storeys below, which in tandem with its pitched form and slight setback will achieve an appropriate degree of subservience.

The bay window feature has larger glazed openings than the floors below. However, each floor level of the building differs in its window arrangement whilst the simple design of this feature will avoid competing with the bold classical detailing on this façade from public view. Its perceived scale will be further reduced by the separation of its glazing with vertical frames. The roof skew will help separate this building at roof level from the extension proposed at 10 to 14 Shandwick Place.

Removal of existing features on the roof (rooflights, chimneys) to facilitate this extension are acceptable. As small-scale additions of limited visibility from public view their loss will not adversely impact on the buildings' overall character.

The buildings rear elevation has previously been altered and its concealed location is not visible from public view. Given this, the proximity of all new development to the sites' rear will have no impact on the wider appreciation or historic interest of the listed building.

Internally, loss of the original staircase and historic walls with subsequent change to its plan form will have some negative heritage impacts. HES have objected on the basis that loss of this staircase would have a harmful impact on the special architectural interest and cultural significance of this building.

These removals are to enable direct, vertical movement between buildings of the new hotel, with existing land level differences preventing use of the current stair for this purpose.

The loss of this staircase is regrettable however it is not the best example of such a feature from the Georgian period. Some evidence has been detailed of alteration to its balustrade and historic changes to its length. Moreover, given changes that have occurred to the floors its context within the building differs now from the historical position. The change forms part of works that help future proof the building through enabling a new use for this building. Moreover, the buildings' special interest as a 3 bay town house of classical detailing with a 20th century shopfront arrangement will be preserved. Other original features (cornicing, panelling, architraves, and shutter boxes) will be retained or relocated.

Overall, the proposals do not harm the special architectural or historic interest of the listed building, or its setting.

2-4 Shandwick Place, 1-4 Queensferry Street LB ref: 51342, 22/07/2009

HES guidance on extensions also states that the presence of a neighbouring high building should not be taken as a reason for an inappropriate roof extension to a historic building.

The former bank building occupies a highly visible position on the corner between Shandwick Place and Queensferry Street. An important aspect of its wider setting is its level of prominence from the east on Princes Street. The buildings' form such as its curved gables and turret feature at roof level are clearly articulated against the sky's backdrop. The height of the building is accentuated by the lower scale of buildings either side.

The new rooftop extension on Shandwick Place will change this view however its lower scale, simple pitched form and use of a dark muted colour will avoid competing with the form and detailing of the former bank building. The simple design will similarly avoid interfering with views onto this key detailing from oblique angles on Shandwick Place.

Small scale alterations to the roof slope here to remove or replace rooflights are acceptable with the replacement slate to match the existing roof slope.

Alterations to the existing hostel entrance will result in the doors not being used. However, this change is reversible, and the installation of a gate will still allow its detailing here to be visible. This alteration is justifiable in the context of overall improvements that will occur to the buildings' frontage. The existing modern glazed shopfront being replaced with a new entrance where its arched form, panelling and materials taking cues from older frontages either side.

Internally, the works will have an impact on the buildings' historic interest through loss of an original staircase. HES have objected on the basis that this loss would have a harmful impact on the listed building. The stairs being the former, main entrance into the bank centrally positioned in the building. Its detailing includes a decorative timber balustrade and stone steps.

The applicant's justification for its removal includes that its original functioning has been altered. The stair formerly extending from ground to fourth floor providing the main 'vertical circulation' into the bank. This was changed in the late 1930s with its length reduced no longer providing ground floor access. Other aspects of the stair were also removed here, including its colonnaded entrance and stair hall.

Other operational challenges for incorporating its retention have also been highlighted. Principally, that connecting the four buildings on-site due to floor level changes. The position of the existing entrance from 3 Queensferry Street provides the best opportunity to achieve this without additional impacts on the floor plan. It has been stated that using the original stair would require additional insertions for fire escape purposes.

The staircase removal will have some adverse impacts on the buildings' historic interest. However, through loss of its original length to the ground floor and associated features, part of its interest has already been diminished. It can no longer be read or appreciated as a central feature into the former bank building from its entrance, as originally intended. Moreover, the decorative pyramidal skylight and decorative cornicing that sits above the stair will be retained. The upper floor space around this will continue to allow occupants the ability to appreciate this design feature. In consideration of this, its loss is justifiable as part of the development as a whole.

The internal works will minimise change to the buildings' public rooms on first and second floor. As detailed in submitted heritage information, original room proportions have generally been altered with later subdivisions evident. The works will remove some non-original walls and new insertions principally for bathrooms pods will not be full height, therefore minimises interference with original decorative ceilings and corning. Raised floor levels here will be confined to bathrooms only, providing level access for services to corridors and lobby space. Some new walls to sub divide hotel bedrooms are justifiable given the original scale and proportions of the rooms have been changed. Similarly, replacing the non-original entrance stair with a new stair and lift access will not result in loss of historic fabric and is appropriate in this regard.

Rooms above these two levels are generally of secondary importance therefore the greater extent of insertions here to form new hotel rooms is appropriate. Original features of special interest will be retained or re-located.

New development to the rear will be in some proximity to this buildings' simpler plain elevation that is not readily visible from public view. Given this context and the space that will be retained here there will be no adverse impact on its setting.

4-8 Queensferry Street LB 29577 dated 14/12/1970.

HES guidance on roofs states historic dormers should be retained. The addition of new features to principal roof slopes should generally be avoided. New dormers should be appropriately designed and located with care.

As per the listing description, this row of townhouses are among the last remaining of the original James Tait plan, well-proportioned and represent their original 19th century design.

The dormers on the roof slope are later 19th century additions. They are historic but appear in a state of some disrepair externally and their inconsistent size is at odds with the regular window pattern below. The chimney to be removed is proportionally small in relation to the townhouse' other chimneys fronting the street. It occupies a more discreet position, its form partly masked by the former bank buildings' gable side. In this context, these removals and a small loss of historic fabric is appropriate.

The new dormers will be of a high-quality modern design, with a scale and form that will sit well on the roof slope. This change will clearly introduce new, distinguishable additions on its principal elevation. However, this townhouse is unique to the immediate context with its scale differing from buildings either side and this change will not break a uniform pattern of development on the street. In these specific circumstances, this change to this townhouse is appropriate. The replacement roof will appropriately match the existing slate.

To the rear, it is recognised the townhouse form will be altered by the new, four storey extension on Queensferry Street Lane with subsequent loss of rear windows. This will impact on a glimpsed view of its subsidiary elevation only. The extension will be set down from the roof slope with the traditional pitched roof form retained. In this context, the development will not adversely impact on its overall setting. New gable windows facing the lane will be of a traditional 'six over six' arrangement appropriately matching those existing.

In light of the above, the proposal will not have a detrimental impact on the architectural character, historic interest or setting of this listed building.

Windows on the listed buildings will be retained and refurbished where practicable or replaced with double glazing if required. Full details of this are required by condition to assess this matter in detail. Similarly, detail of all external materials are required by condition for this reason.

All other listed buildings in the sites' vicinity will not materially be impacted on by the development therefore no assessment of heritage impacts is required.

Conclusion in relation to the listed building

The proposal will have significant impacts on listed buildings particularly through the loss of original staircases and Historic Environment Scotland have objected on these grounds. Internally, changes to these features have already occurred which have diminished their contribution to the buildings' overall historic or special interest. The degree of further intervention to these features is appropriate in this context as its overall impact is not harmful. It forms part of works that help provide a new use to these buildings. All other changes are appropriate in this regard. The proposal in scale, form and design is also in keeping with the historic environment.

The proposal is therefore acceptable with regard to Sections 14 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 as it will not harm the listed buildings or their setting.

b) The proposals harm the character or appearance of the conservation area.

The New Town Conservation Area Character Appraisal states that the area is typified by the formal plan layout, spacious stone-built terraces, broad streets, and an overall classical elegance. The buildings are of a generally consistent three storey and basement scale, with some four-storey corner and central pavilions.

The historic environment generally has consistency in the use of traditional materials (stone, slate), however there is some variety to buildings form and scale. Later, alterations are also evident including roof extensions on Shandwick Place.

This historic townscape is therefore not defined by one architectural style. Whilst the proposed changes to the roof will clearly be modern, their simple design, proportionate scale and dark muted tones will blend suitably with this historic context where change has occurred.

Space to the rear has significantly been developed with large extensions evident on the site and nearby on former courtyards. The extension is appropriately scaled given this context and its lighter shades of render will be compatible with the existing use of this material and stone nearby.

Similarly, its height facing onto Queensferry Street Lane will be in-keeping with the generally continuous line of buildings on its south side. Buildings here vary in quality, age, and design. In this context, an appropriately scaled modern building will not appear at odds with its surroundings.

Larger down takings will include removal of structures in some state of disrepair (dormers and building on Queensferry Street & Lane) or more modern additions of functional design (part of rear courtyard extension, Queensferry Street shopfront). Their removal is appropriate as they do not presently make positive contributions to the conservation area. All other removals will have no material impact on this historic environment as a whole as they are small parts of the buildings on-site.

The full details of material specification will be required by condition to ensure these details are appropriate to the conservation area.

The hotel use is also in keeping with the range of uses evident in this part of the New Town.

Conclusion in relation to the conservation area

Overall, the proposal in scale form and design will preserve the character and appearance of the conservation area. It is therefore acceptable with regard to Section 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997.

<u>Archaeology</u>

The City Archaeologist has been consulted on the proposals and has raised concern regarding the archaeological impact from loss of the staircase at 4-8 Queensferry Street.

However, overall, it is concluded that the proposals will have a moderate archaeological impact and a condition is recommended for a detailed programme of archaeological historic building recording and reporting to be undertaken.

c) there are any other matters to consider.

The following matters have been identified for consideration:

Equalities and human rights

The development is suitable for a range of users. Level access is provided into the building from Queensferry Street with lift access to all floors near this entrance.

Accessible bedrooms are provided on each floor near to the lifts. A fully accessible route is provided for staff into the building and non-standard cycles are incorporated.

Due regard has been given to section 149 of the Equalities Act 2010 through consideration of the above.

Consideration has been given to human rights. No impacts have been identified through the assessment and no comments have been received in relation to human rights.

Public representations

A summary of the representations is provided below:

support

material considerations

- Positive impact on area through design and new use: Addressed through sections a) and b)
- Conservation Area: Addressed in section b) Conservation Area and WHS

non-material considerations

- Preserve World Heritage Site
- Sustainability credentials of development
- Well-connected location
- Economic and social benefit from hotel use
- Reputation of developer
- The above matters have been assessed through this concurrent planning application and are not material to this listed building consent application.

objection

material considerations

- Harmful impact from internal alterations (staircase removals, raised floor height, impact on original features, room proportions): Addressed in section a) Listed Buildings.
- Adverse impact from external alterations (alterations and extensions to roofs, door alterations): Addressed in section a) Listed Buildings.
- Adverse impact from additional storey on 4-8 Queensferry Street: This aspect has been removed from the revised plans.
- Detail of window changes required: A condition has been included for details of this to be submitted.

non-material considerations

- Impact on commercial units from construction activity: This matter cannot be assessed under this listed building consent application.
- Potential property damage: This matter cannot be assessed under this listed building consent application.
- Proposal is contrary to LDP policy Env 4: This policy has been superseded and is no longer applicable.

Conclusion in relation to other matters considered.

Other matters support the presumption to grant listed building consent.

Overall conclusion

The proposal will have significant impacts on listed buildings particularly through the loss of original staircases and Historic Environment Scotland have objected on these grounds.

Internally, changes to these features have already occurred which have diminished their contribution to the buildings' overall historic or special interest. The degree of further intervention to these features is appropriate in this context as its overall impact is not harmful. It forms part of works that help provide a new use to these buildings. All other changes are appropriate in this regard. The proposal in scale, form and design is also in keeping with the historic environment.

The proposal is therefore acceptable with regard to Sections 14 and 64 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 as it will not harm the listed buildings, their setting and will preserve the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

The application requires the Scottish Ministers to be notified prior to determination due to the outstanding objection from Historic Environment Scotland.

Section C - Conditions/Reasons/Informatives

The recommendation is subject to the following.

Conditions

- A detailed specification, including trade names where appropriate, of all the proposed external materials shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority before work is commenced on site; Note: samples of the materials may be required.
- 2. No demolition/alterations/development shall take place on the site until the applicant has secured the implementation of a programme of archaeological work (historic building recording, interpretation, conservation, analysis & reporting, publication) in accordance with a written scheme of investigation which has been submitted by the applicant and approved by the Planning Authority.
- A detailed specification of the proposed alterations to all existing windows as detailed on approved plans reference 66 A - 71 A shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority before work is commenced on site.

Reasons

- 1. In order to enable the planning authority to consider this/these matter/s in detail.
- 2. In order to safeguard the interests of archaeological heritage.
- 3. To safeguard the character of listed buildings and the conservation area.

Informatives

It should be noted that:

- 1. The works hereby permitted shall be commenced no later than the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.
- 2. The application requires the Scottish Ministers to be notified prior to determination due to the outstanding objection from Historic Environment Scotland.

Background Reading/External References

To view details of the application go to the Planning Portal

Further Information - Local Development Plan

Date Registered: 3 May 2023

Drawing Numbers/Scheme

01 - 04, 06 - 14, 15 A - 22 A, 23 C, 24 B, 25 A- 28 A29 B - 30 B, 31 C, 32 A - 43 A, 44 B - 45 B, 46 A-52 A, 53 B53 B, 54 A - 62 A, 63 B - 64 B, 65 B, 66 A - 71 A, 72 C, 75

Scheme 2

David Givan
Chief Planning Officer
PLACE
The City of Edinburgh Council

Contact: Lewis McWilliam, Planning Officer E-mail: lewis.mcwilliam@edinburgh.gov.uk

Appendix 1

Summary of Consultation Responses

NAME: Historic Environment Scotland

COMMENT: Objection due to harmful impact on listed buildings through loss of

staircases.

DATE: 14 December 2023

NAME: Archaeologist

COMMENT: Concern regarding removal of staircase to however overall proposals are considered to have a moderate archaeological impact.

A condition for a programme of archaeological works is recommended should consent be granted.

DATE: 10 November 2023

The full consultation response can be viewed on the <u>Planning & Building Standards</u> <u>Portal</u>.

Location Plan



© Crown Copyright and database right 2014. All rights reserved. Ordnance Survey License number 100023420